

**GTC PLANNING COMMITTEE**  
**Livingston County Government Center - Room 205/208**  
**November 18, 2004**

PLANNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT

Jeffrey Adair, Monroe County  
James Brady, Wayne County  
Joan Dupont, NYSDOT – Region 4  
Michael Garland, Monroe County – At Large  
Richard Garrabrant, NYS Thruway Authority  
Timothy Hens, Genesee County  
Kristen Mark Hughes, Ontario County  
Fred Humphrey, Wyoming County  
Paul Johnson, Monroe County Planning Board  
Scott Leathersich, Monroe County – At Large  
Charles Nesbitt, Jr., Empire State Development Corporation  
Terrence J. Rice, Monroe County  
George Stam, City of Rochester  
David Woods, Livingston County  
David Zorn, G/FLRPC

ALTERNATE REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT

David Cook, RGRTA, representing Mark Aesch

OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE

Deborah Elliott, GTC Staff  
Erik Frisch, GTC Staff  
Jason Haremza, G/FLRPC  
Richard Perrin, GTC Staff  
Robert Scholl, NYSDOT – Region 4  
Rob Slaver, NYSDOT – Region 4  
James Stack, GTC Staff  
John Thomas, City of Rochester

PLANNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT AND UNREPRESENTED

Philip Brito, FAA  
Glenn Cooke, Seneca County  
Robert Griffith, FHWA  
Tracy Logel, Monroe County Supervisors' Association  
Kenneth Rush, Orleans County  
Larry Stid, Rochester City Planning Commission  
William Sullivan, Rochester City Council  
Clara Wallace-Douglas, FTA  
(Vacant), Yates County  
(Vacant), NYS Department of Environmental Conservation  
(Vacant), City of Rochester – At Large

## 1. **Call to Order & Introductions**

David Woods called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Members, Alternates, and others present introduced themselves.

## 2. **Public Forum**

No one from the public spoke during the Public Forum.

## 3. **Approval of Minutes**

Terry Rice requested corrections be made to the minutes regarding his statements with respect to the feasibility of alternatives included in UPWP studies as part of item 4.b.1. and that he had suggested the City draft a letter to Highway Superintendents, not "Supervisors", regarding fill material for the Broad Street Tunnel project as part of item 4.b.2.

In addition, David Woods requested corrections be made to the minutes to more fully include the discussion of better defining the study area and inclusion of areas outside Monroe County in the Scope of Work for UPWP Task 5620 as part of item 5.b.1

**Terrence Rice moved for approval of the minutes from the October 21, 2004 Planning Committee meeting with the corrections; David Zorn seconded the motion. The minutes were approved as corrected.**

## 4. **Reports and Action on Old Business**

### a. Reports on UPWP Projects and Other Activities

*GTC*

Richard Perrin reported:

- GTC staff has developed an outline for the GTC Strategic Plan. Interviews are being held for the two available staff positions
- There is no progress to report on the Rural County Resource Development Initiative
- Identification of Steering Committee members and development of a survey of information users for the Transportation Safety Information Analysis is nearly complete
- Recommendation for adoption of the Long Range Transportation Plan will be presented later in the meeting. GTC staff have completed the third round of public meetings. The public involvement for the LRTP consisted of 18 public meetings and approximately seven months of open comment period
- An update on Air Quality Planning and Outreach will be provided later in the meeting

- The City of Rochester has identified an additional high priority site for the Transportation and Industrial Access project. GTC staff will restart the project in early-2005
- A scope of work for the Greater Rochester Transportation Operations and Management Organization Feasibility Study was approved at the October 21 Planning Committee meeting. GTC staff will revise the language to better define the study area and inclusion of areas outside Monroe County
- There is no progress to report on the Regional Rights-Of-Way Preservation Study
- The Non-Emergency Medical Transportation Study (NEMS) is complete
- The Priority Trails Advancement (PTA) project has three sub-projects: the Canandaigua Rail-with-Trail project final report is complete. The City of Rochester Neighborhood Connectors project final report is complete. The Auburn Trail project draft final report is under review. All three projects are expected for closeout at the January Planning Committee meeting. A meeting to select a consultant for the three 2004-05 Priority Trails Advancement projects was held on Tuesday, November 16
- A Technical Memo of accepted treatments for the On-Street Bicycle Facilities Opportunities Review is nearly complete
- Migration of the GTC travel demand model to a new platform has not progressed as expected for the Congestion Management System (CMS). GTC staff are investigating options to address the issues. Performance Measures have been developed. Anticipate reconvening the CMS Working Group when the LRTP is completed
- The two components of Transportation Information Resources – Rural ITS and Context Sensitive Design/Solutions – are complete and have been added to the GTC website. Staff will identify additional topics for next fiscal year
- The TIP Development Committee (TDC) reviewed the draft recommendations for the TIP Management Enhancement Study and provided input to the consultant at the November 9 TDC meeting. The consultant will make revisions based on input from the TDC

*G/FLRPC*

David Zorn reported:

- The Regional Land Use Monitoring project is complete for 2003
- A recommendation to accept the Regional Development Projections report will be presented later in the meeting
- There is no progress to report on the Preparing Village Main Streets for Planning project
- A Scope of Work for the Optimizing Transportation Infrastructure through Effective Land Use project is expected to be presented to the Planning Committee later this fiscal year
- The final layout and design for the Regional Atlas is complete

### *Livingston County*

David Woods reported:

- Five consultant proposals were received and are under review for the Horizontal Alignment Safety Study. A meeting between Livingston County and GTC staff will be held to select a preferred consultant

### *Monroe County*

Terry Rice reported:

- Data collection for the Monroe County Traffic Count Collection project is complete and being processed
- The consultant for the Pedestrian Activity Safety Study has identified 25 locations for additional analysis and development of alternatives
- The consultant for the Ballantyne Road Corridor Study is back on schedule after TModel delay problems. The existing and future conditions report is nearly complete

Paul Johnson reported:

- Data collection for the Monroe County Land Use Monitoring project for 2004 is ongoing
- Seasonal counts for the Monroe County Parking Study are complete. Monroe County staff are conducting quality control on the data prior to analysis

### *Ontario County*

Kris Hughes reported:

- Work is continuing on the Route 332 Corridor Management Study
- The Steering Committee for the Canandaigua Regional Transportation Study will meet on December 6<sup>th</sup>

### *City of Rochester*

George Stam reported:

- No progress to report on the Port of Rochester Transportation Evaluation and Support Study
- No progress to report on the Neighborhood Traffic Calming Concept Design and Implementation Study
- The final report for the Highland Park/Canalway Neighborhood Connector Trail Study was approved at the October Planning Committee meeting

- No progress to report on the RGRTA/City of Rochester ITS Implementation Plan (City of Rochester component)

#### *RGRTA*

David Cook reported:

- The consultant for the Security and Safety Plan for Public Transportation is continuing progress on developing a draft Plan for security policies and procedures

David Cook and Richard Perrin will schedule a meeting to discuss options to advance the other current projects

#### *Seneca County*

Richard Perrin reported:

- The scope of work for the State Route 96/State Route 318 Rural Corridor Study – Phase I was approved at the October Planning Committee meeting. An RFP is being developed

#### *Wayne County*

James Brady reported:

- There is no progress to report on the Cluster Development Enhancement Project Feasibility Study

#### *Wyoming County*

Fred Humphrey reported:

- There is no progress to report on the Transportation & Scenic/Historic Resources in Wyoming

#### *Yates County*

Richard Perrin reported:

- There is no progress to report on the Route 14A Corridor Study. GTC staff have contacted Yates County regarding restarting the project

## *Other Agencies*

Members of the three agencies conducting the Regional Traffic Count Collection project reported no progress.

### b. Any Other Old Business or Announcements

- I. There was no old business or announcements.

## **5. Planning Committee Action Items**

- a. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning Adopting the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region: 2005-2025* / Proposed Council Resolution 04-39

Richard Perrin discussed the draft LRTP document. He noted that the LRTP includes policies and actions by mode in three categories: preservation, operations, and expansion. These policies and actions are intended to guide further planning and investment decision making through the UPWP and TIP processes, respectively. The LRTP attempts to present a large amount of technical transportation planning based information in a readable manner for policymakers and the general public alike.

Richard stated that the LRTP is the official long range plan for the Rochester TMA but includes the remainder of the region because of the impacts that the TMA and non-TMA have on each other.

Richard noted that GTC staff will continue to review the document for editorial improvements. Upon adoption by the Board, an executive summary will be produced. The UPWP includes funding for a graphic designer to enhance the document's presentation including formatting, refining graphics, and including photographs.

Richard reviewed the public comments that were received since the Planning Committee package mailing and asked for comments.

Terry Rice complimented GTC on the development of the LRTP. He noted the maps on pages 28, 29, and 30 were difficult to understand in black and white. Richard responded that the maps will be in color in the final document. Terry also added that the Monroe County Sheriff is not located in the Regional Traffic Operations Center as stated on page 32.

Terry Rice noted the discussion of the funding shortfall on page 70. He expected the overall need to be higher than \$2.51 billion. Richard Perrin responded that the cost estimates are only for Federal-aid expenditures and were developed in a very conservative fashion and that the LRTP noted such. Richard suggested that a stronger statement about the conservative approach to estimating the need be added. Terry concurred.

Joan Dupont noted that the LRTP further shifts GTC's investment policy from system expansion through capital projects to management, operations, and preservation of the existing system, impacting future TIPs. Joan also noted that she attended a meeting in Albany with several DOT regions. The Rochester region did not have as many "big ticket" jobs. This may be a function of timing or managed expectations.

David Woods asked what the long range plan for the non-TMA area is. Joan Dupont stated that the non-TMA would be included in the statewide transportation master plan. The NYSDOT-sponsored meetings held this past summer were intended to gather public input from across the state.

Joan Dupont stated that the statewide master plan will be less specific. The LRTP process included outreach to non-TMA areas which helps the region identify needs. NYSDOT staff is available to meet with counties and local municipalities to discuss transportation opportunities and concerns.

David Woods suggested that GTC and G/FLRPC work together when sponsoring public meetings for the LRTP and Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy (CEDS) since there are overlapping issues.

Richard Perrin noted that GTC reviewed the comments received for the CEDS as part of the LRTP development process. David Zorn added that G/FLRPC did the same by reviewing public comments for the LRTP as part of the CEDS process.

**Terrence Rice moved to recommend approval of Proposed Council Resolution 04-39; Joan Dupont seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.**

- b. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning Amending the FY 2004-05 & FY 2005-06 UPWP budgets to reflect the contribution of revised FHWA PL and FTA MPP allocations / Proposed Council Resolution 04-40

Richard Perrin explained the increased allocations of funds and the options available for potential uses. Notice of the increased allocations was received after the August Planning Committee meeting. Richard noted that the TEA-21 extensions had higher allocations than estimated during the development of the UPWP, resulting in the increased PL and MPP funding for FY 2004-05.

Richard Perrin discussed options for utilizing the increased funds, noting NYSDOT and USDOT priorities. He discussed the potential development of regional Goods Movement and Bicycle/Pedestrian plans.

Joan Dupont noted it is a good idea to look at a mid-course adjustment for the two-year UPWP.

Terry Rice suggested that the UPWP Development Committee (UDC) reconvene to review existing projects that were worthwhile, but did not get funded. He felt these should be considered prior before identifying new projects.

David Zorn asked if procedurally there could be a new call for projects. Richard Perrin responded that nothing precludes GTC from doing so.

David Woods suggested the UDC should revisit those projects that were submitted last time to see if project sponsors are still interested in conducting the projects. He stated that the emphasis should be on identifying quality projects. David noted that there was a good project that just missed the cut for inclusion in the FY 2004-05 PTA program and that this project could possibly be submitted for consideration now that additional funding is available.

David Woods noted that the discussion indicated that the Planning Committee would prefer that the UDC reconvene to identify projects to be funded with the increased allocations. Committee members concurred. Richard Perrin stated that GTC staff will contact the UDC to determine the process for selecting projects for funding with the increased allocation.

**Kris Hughes moved to recommend approval of Proposed Council Resolution 04-40; Scott Leathersich seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.**

- c. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning Establishing responsibilities between GTC and NYSDOT for addressing air quality conformity requirements / Proposed Council Resolution 04-41

Richard Perrin discussed the need to identify the Metropolitan Planning Area (MPA) for air quality conformity purposes. The proposed resolution would create consistency between the responsibilities for programming federal transportation funds and conducting conformity analyses on projects receiving these funds.

Richard noted that the entire six-county Rochester MSA was designated nonattainment and subject to conformity. However, GTC is responsible for programming funds in the Rochester TMA and NYSDOT is responsible for the area outside the TMA.

Joan Dupont noted that only projects in the Rochester TMA could be modeled and that projects outside the TMA would undergo a qualitative analysis. Joan stated that NYSDOT concurred with the establishment of responsibilities per the proposed resolution because it is consistent with federal requirements and makes the most sense.

**Joan Dupont moved to recommend approval of Proposed Council Resolution 04-41; Terrence Rice seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.**

- d. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning Accepting the report, Regional Development Analysis, as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 5220 / Proposed Council Resolution 04-42

David Zorn discussed the overall process for developing the Regional Development Analysis projections. An Executive Summary was included in the package. The entire report is available on the G/FLRPC website.

Jason Haremza discussed the technical approach to conducting the project. Jason noted the anomaly of having greater than 100% development in certain areas and the impact of negative population growth on the mathematical model.

George Stam asked where the surplus demand for development gets assigned. He questioned the assumption that only agriculture and vacant land is available for development and seems to discount the redevelopment of brownfields and adaptive reuse of land with existing structures.

David Zorn stated real property service data includes a category for vacant land with structures, accounting for some land with existing structures and brownfields.

Kris Hughes commented that the recent Hubbert report regarding oil extraction and future use projections indicates a doubling or tripling of gas prices in 5 to 10 years. If this happens then planning assumptions need to be revisited and the City of Rochester and inner ring suburbs with existing infrastructure will likely be more attractive for development.

**Michael Garland moved to recommend approval of Proposed Council Resolution 04-42; David Zorn seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.**

- e. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning Amending the 2003-2008 TIP by increasing the total cost of the Genesee River Trail project / Proposed Council Resolution 04-43

John Thomas discussed the TIP amendment.

**George Stam moved to recommend approval of Proposed Council Resolution 04-43; Scott Leathersich seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.**

Joan Dupont reiterated her comments from the November 8 TDC meeting that NYSDOT was able to find funds to cover the right-of-way cost increase but could not guarantee they would be able to cover any increase in construction. She encouraged the City to look closely at construction costs.

## **6. Planning Committee Information Items**

### **a. Air Quality Update**

Richard Perrin stated that GTC staff will revise the Air Quality Planning and Outreach scope of work to include greater involvement of the consultant in the conformity process. In addition, the consultant is developing a technical memorandum regarding associated costs and benefits of CMAQ-eligible projects. The scope was developed when the region was seeking an “unclassifiable” designation and now needs to be revised since the region was designated “nonattainment”.

Other activities include:

- Consultant review of a draft letter requesting the region be included in the NYSDOT CMAQ funds distribution formula.
- GTC staff discussions with NYSDOT Environmental Analysis Bureau to finalize what elements will be required from the GTC travel demand model.

### **b. Triennial Joint FHWA/FTA Certification Review**

Richard Perrin discussed the triennial FWA/FTA certification review scheduled for November 29 through December 1. He referred to the recent notification to Board and Planning Committee members regarding the group interview periods and requested their participation if possible.

Richard stated that GTC has provided FHWA and FTA with the items requested for their desk review.

A public meeting is scheduled for November 29, 2004 at the Rochester Public Library.

Richard noted that he requested that FHWA and FTA provide their questions for member agencies in advance of the review and would follow up with FHWA and FTA on this matter.

## **7. New Business**

Richard Perrin distributed the GTC 2005 Meeting Calendar. After some discussion, the January meeting was changed from the usual third Thursday of the month to Friday, January 21, 2005 because of a conflict with other meetings.

Richard noted that there is the potential for the UDC to meet after Planning Committee meeting on February 17, 2005.

**8. Next Meeting**

The next Planning Committee meeting will be held Friday, January 21, 2005 at a location to be determined.

**9. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 11:48 a.m.