

**GENESEE TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL
QUARTERLY BOARD MEETING
Park Plaza Hotel
Henrietta, NY**

December 9, 2004

GTC BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Maggie Brooks, Monroe County (GTC Vice Chair)
Marvin Decker, Wayne County (GTC Chairman)
Paul E. Haney, Rochester At-Large
Daniel Hogan, Monroe County At-Large
Esther Leadley, Genesee/Finger Lakes Regional Planning Council
Gay H. Lenhard, Monroe County Supervisors' Association
Ed Marianetti, Monroe County At-Large
Wayne Zyra, Monroe County

ALTERNATE REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT

Mark Aesch, RGRTA, representing William Nojay
Samuel J. Casella, Ontario County, representing Carmen Orlando
Ed Doherty, City of Rochester, representing William Johnson
Richard Garrabrant, NYS Thruway Authority, representing Michael Fleischer
Paul Johnson, Monroe County Planning Board, representing Bonnie Pedrick-Coles
Charles Moynihan, NYSDOT – Region 4, representing Joseph Boardman
Richard Rudolph, Genesee County, representing Mary Pat Hancock
David Woods, Livingston County, representing James Merrick

GTC BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT AND UNREPRESENTED

Robert Arnold, Federal Highway Administration
A. Douglas Berwanger, Wyoming County
Philip Brito, Federal Aviation Administration
Erin M. Crotty, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Charles Gargano, Empire State Development Corporation
Lois Giess, Rochester City Council
Dana K. Miller, Rochester City Planning Commission
Robert Multer, Yates County
Robert Shipley, Seneca County
Letitia Thompson, Federal Transit Administration
Marcia Tuohey, Orleans County

OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE

Deborah Elliott, GTC Staff
James Fabino, Town of Lyons
Erik Frisch, GTC Staff
Kristen Mark Hughes, Ontario County
Marvin Kleinberg, NYSDOT – Region 4
Richard Perrin, GTC Staff
Rob Slaver, NYSDOT – Region 4
James Stack, GTC Staff
David Zorn, Genesee/Finger Lakes Regional Planning Council

1. Call to Order

Chairman Decker called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

2. Roll Call

James Stack, GTC staff, called the roll; a quorum was present.

3. Public Forum

No one from the public spoke during the Public Forum.

4. Approval of Minutes

Dan Hogan moved for approval of the minutes from the September 9, 2004 GTC Quarterly Board meeting; Esther Leadley seconded the motion. The minutes were approved as submitted.

Wayne Zyra asked for clarification on the feasibility of recommendations included in the *Highland Park/Canalway Trail Planning and Concept Design*.

Richard Perrin explained that this is a concept plan that includes feasible alternatives, however there are some operational improvements that require further study in the final design.

Maggie Brooks added that Terry Rice has genuine concerns regarding the feasibility of some elements and the study needed additional work. She stated that when it was time to vote on the resolution, she would abstain.

5. Communications and Announcements

- Richard Perrin announced the following appointment to the GTC Board:
 - Monroe County – Jeffrey Adair appointed as an Alternate to the Board
- Richard Perrin announced the following appointment to the Planning Committee:
 - Monroe County – Jeffrey Adair appointed to the Committee. Jeff Lurie designated as Mr. Adair's Alternate to the Committee

6. Reports and Action on Old Business

- a. Planning Committee Report – David Woods, Chairman

David Woods provided the following report:

At its October 21, 2004 meeting, the Planning Committee:

- Recommended that the Board accept the report, *Highland Park/Canalway Trail Planning and Concept Design*, as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 6520
- Recommended that the Board amend the 2003-2008 TIP by increasing the total cost of the Broad Street Tunnel project
- Approved the draft *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region: 2005-2025* for public review
- Approved the scope of work for the following UPWP tasks:
 - Task 5620 – Greater Rochester Transportation Operations & Management Organization Feasibility Study
 - Task 7550 – State Route 96/State Route 318 Rural Corridor Study – Phase I

At its November 18, 2004 meeting, the Planning Committee:

- Recommended that the Board adopt the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region: 2005-2025*
- Recommended that the Board amend the FY 2004-05 & FY 2005-06 UPWP budgets to reflect the contribution of revised FHWA PL and FTA MPP allocations
- Recommended that the Board adopt Resolution 04-41 establishing responsibilities between GTC and NYSDOT for addressing air quality conformity requirements
- Recommended that the Board accept the report, *Regional Development Analysis*, as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 5220
- Recommended that the Board amend the 2003-2008 TIP by increasing the total cost of the Genesee River Trail project

b. GTC Executive Director's Report – Richard Perrin

Richard Perrin provided the following report:

- GTC staff has completed work on the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region: 2005-2025* (LRTP). The LRTP has been reviewed by the LRTP Development Committee and the Planning Committee. It will be addressed later in the agenda
- GTC staff continued activities to ensure the region meets Air Quality requirements under the non-conformity designation. The conformity process will require additional analysis and documentation by GTC staff with assistance from member agencies. An adjustment was made to the traditional meeting schedule for the GTC Board and Planning Committee to meet the Federally-mandated deadline of June 15, 2005. A joint letter from Marvin Decker, GTC Chairman, and Charles Moynihan, NYSDOT- Region 4 Director needs to be drafted to

request that the non-attainment area be included in the current Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) funding distribution formula

- The 2005-2010 TIP development process is progressing. The TIP Development Committee met on December 7th to review and discuss the preliminary ranking of the proposals received.

Mark Aesch noted that, historically, cost increases on existing projects were automatically taken off the top and asked how that would be handled in this TIP cycle.

Richard Perrin responded that it might be handled the same way as in the past; however, some projects may need to be revisited if their scopes have changed dramatically.

Mark Aesch added that during the last TIP cycle both the Planning Committee and Board encouraged GTC to not reward poor project scoping with automatic funding in future TIP cycles.

Richard Perrin acknowledged that and added that the TIP Management Enhancement Study is looking into how the TIP development process can be refined to address such concerns.

c. Old Business

Richard Perrin informed the Board that the Triennial Joint FHWA/FTA Certification Review conducted November 29 through December 1 went well. GTC is meeting the Federal requirements and will receive a draft review document within the next couple months.

Mr. Perrin also recognized the work of former GTC Executive Director Steve Gleason, who implemented many of the recommendations of the 1998 Certification Review during his tenure.

7. New Business

- a. Adopting the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region: 2005-2025* – Action on Resolution 04-39

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolution 04-39. He explained the LRTP development process and the associated document. He noted that an Executive Summary will be developed after the Board adopts the LRTP. Finally, Rich added that the project budget includes funds for a graphic designer to give the final document a more professional look.

Sam Casella moved to approve Resolution 04-39; Maggie Brooks seconded. The motion passed unopposed.

Maggie Brooks mentioned a correction on page 33 regarding RTOC and NYS Police.

Paul Haney asked if an analysis had been conducted as part of the LRTP development in regards to light rail or commuter rail transit.

Richard Perrin noted that GTC staff met with the Chairman of the Rochester Rail Transit Committee to discuss their interests and concerns. Mr. Perrin stated that he did not feel that a reliable feasibility study has been conducted to justify including a rail transit system in the LRTP and that the region would have to provide at least 50% of the cost of constructing such a system from non-Federal sources. The LRTP includes a recommendation to study “high-capacity” transit options, including rail as well as Bus Rapid Transit (BRT).

Sam Casella asked about the amount of public involvement for the LRTP.

Rich Perrin responded that GTC held 18 public meetings throughout the region over the course of developing the LRTP. Although some of the meetings were unattended, the public meetings held in the City of Rochester were always well attended. The responses that were received were generally positive.

- b. **Amending the FY 2004-05 & 2005-06 UPWP Budgets to Reflect the Contribution of Revised FHWA PL and FTA MPP Allocations – Action on Resolution 04-40**

Richard Perrin explained Proposed Council Resolution 04-40. He noted that this Resolution does not decide how the increased allocation would be spent, it only accepts the funds. The Planning Committee recommended that the UPWP Development Committee reconvene to discuss options and to specifically reconsider past proposals that were not funded.

Paul Haney moved to approve Resolution 04-40; Wayne Zyra seconded. The motion passed unopposed.

- c. **Establishing responsibilities between GTC and NYSDOT for addressing air quality conformity requirements – Action on Resolution 04-41**

Richard Perrin explained Proposed Council Resolution 04-41

Charles Moynihan moved to approve Resolution 04-41; Gay Lenhard seconded. The motion passed unopposed.

Ed Doherty asked what effect this Resolution will have.

Richard Perrin responded that the Resolution defines the roles of the MPO and NYSDOT in the conformity process for the Rochester MSA.

- d. Accepting the final project reports as evidence of completion of various UPWP tasks
 - (1) Accepting the report, *Highland Park/Canalway Trail Planning and Concept Design*, as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 6520 – Action on Resolution 04-31
 - (2) Accepting the report, *Regional Development Analysis*, as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 5220 – Action on Resolution 04-42

Richard Perrin explained Proposed Council Resolution 04-31

Ed Doherty moved to approve Resolution 04-31; Paul Haney seconded. The motion passed with 4 abstentions.

Richard Perrin explained Proposed Council Resolution 04-42

Ed Doherty moved to approve Resolution 04-42; Paul Haney seconded. The motion passed unopposed.

- e. Adopting amendments to the 2003-2008 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP)
 - (1) Amending the 2003-2008 TIP by increasing the total cost of the Broad Street Tunnel project – Action on Resolution 04-38
 - (2) Amending the 2003-2008 TIP by increasing the total cost of the Genesee River Trail project – Action on Resolution 04-43

Richard Perrin explained both resolutions.

Ed Doherty moved to approve Resolution 04-42; Charles Moynihan seconded. The motion passed unopposed.

Wayne Zyra asked about the size of the cost increase for the Broad Street Tunnel project.

Richard Perrin noted that this is a very unique project with significant public interest. He added that the increase is the result of a more refined design estimate and inflation.

Ed Doherty responded that time was the biggest factor for the cost increase on this project. Over the last ten years many alternatives were explored. The final and most cost effective recommendation was to discontinue use of the tunnel.

Mark Aesch questioned whether this project would come back for additional TIP funds and whether it might be preferable to wait until final design is complete before amending the TIP.

Ed Doherty responded that the City is looking to proceed toward construction and that this amendment reflects the best available cost estimates. The City would be uncomfortable expending considerable public funds on final design for the project without assurance that construction funds would be available.

Paul Haney noted the relatively significant costs involved on trails projects and asked if cost/benefit analyses were done on these projects.

Richard Perrin responded that trail improvements are considered viable transportation options by the federal government and that they serve a quality of life function that is difficult to quantify.

Ed Doherty added that this particular project is unique in that it was funded through National Highway System (NHS) funds because of its relationship to Lake Avenue.

Paul Haney mentioned that 28 letters received during the LRTP public review period are exactly alike but with different names and were faxed to GTC within a short time frame around 5:00 p.m. Mr. Haney asked if GTC knew who sent these letters.

Richard Perrin responded that GTC staff did not know to whom the fax number belonged and that we expected similar actions from other groups advocating for their various interests.

f. Any Other New Business

(1) 2005 Meeting Calendar

Rich Perrin discussed the final 2005 meeting calendar that replaces the draft calendar that was presented at the September meeting.

8. Next Meeting

The next Board Meeting will be held Thursday, March 10, 2005 at 8:30 a.m. at the Park Plaza Hotel in Henrietta.

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 9:30 a.m.