

**GENESEE TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING
Livingston County Highway Department
4389 Gypsy Lane, Groveland**

February 14, 2013

PLANNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT

Angela Ellis, Livingston County (Vice Chairperson)
James Fletcher, Monroe County – At Large
Erik Frisch, City of Rochester – At Large
Todd Gadd, Wyoming County
Thomas Goodwin, Monroe County Planning Board
Andrea Guzzetta, City of Rochester, City Council
Daniel Hallowell, NYS Department of Transportation (NYSDOT)-Region 4
Timothy Hens, Genesee County
Paul Holahan, City of Rochester
Scott Leathersich, Monroe County – At Large (Chairperson)
Terrence J. Rice, Monroe County
Kevin Rooney, Wayne County
William Wright, Ontario County
David Zorn, Genesee/Finger Lakes Regional Planning Council (G/FLRPC)

ALTERNATE REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT

David Cook, Rochester Genesee Regional Transportation Authority (RGRTA), representing Bill Carpenter
David Hartman, Yates County
Paul Zakrzewski, NYS Thruway Authority, representing Douglas J. Tokarczyk

PLANNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT AND UNREPRESENTED

Donald Allport, Orleans County
Robert Colby, Monroe County
Peter McCann, Monroe County Supervisors' Association
Edward Muszynski, Empire State Development Corporation
Mitchell Rowe, Seneca County
Steven Ulass, Federal Aviation Administration (FAA)
David Watson, Rochester City Planning Commission
(Vacant), Federal Highway Administration (FHWA)
(Vacant), Federal Transportation Administration (FTA)
(Vacant), NYS Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC)
(Vacant), Yates County

OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE

Joseph Bovenzi, GTC staff
Tony Favro, GTC staff
Don Higgins, Livingston County
Timothy Keef, Town of Brighton
Thomas Lichtenthal, Town of Batavia
Sharon Lilla, Barton & Loguidice
James McIntosh, City of Rochester
Brent Penwarden, Monroe County

Richard Perrin, GTC staff
John Polimeni, NYSDOT-Region 4
James Pond, Monroe County
Chris Reeve, NYSDOT-Region 4
Roseann Schmid, Fisher Associates
James Stack, GTC staff
Patrick Waterman, KCI Engineering

1. Call to Order & Introductions

Scott Leathersich, Planning Committee Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m. Members, Alternates, and others present introduced themselves.

Don Higgins, as host, added a special welcome to all present, especially his friend and colleague Kevin Rooney.

2. Public Forum

No one from the public spoke during the Public Forum.

3. Approval of Minutes

Bill Wright moved for approval of the minutes from the January 10, 2013 Planning Committee meeting; Paul Zakrzewski seconded the motion. The minutes were approved as presented.

4. Reports and Action on Old Business

a. Reports on Old Business and Other Activities

1. Announcements

Richard Perrin announced that:

By his election as Chairman of the Ontario County Board of Supervisors, John F. Marren is the Ontario County member of the GTC Board.

James Merrick, Chairman of the Livingston County Board of Supervisors, has reappointed Angela Ellis as his alternate to the GTC Board and as the County's Planning Committee member. Don Higgins and Heather Ferrero have been reappointed as Ms. Ellis' alternates to the Planning Committee.

Rochester Mayor Thomas Richards has appointed Jeff Mroczek as the City's At Large alternate to the GTC Planning Committee.

b. Any Other Old Business or Announcements

1. *2014-2017 Transportation Improvement Program* Development

Richard Perrin provided an update on the status of the development of the next TIP. One-hundred-fifty proposals totaling \$385 million in requested federal funds were received by the January 23 deadline. Currently, GTC staff expects about \$230 million in funding to be available in Federal Fiscal Years 2015 through 2017 for programming by GTC to these requests. Agencies that submitted these proposals have made presentations to GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staffs over the past two weeks. Clarifications and updated information on the proposals have been and

continue to be provided so that GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staffs can fully evaluate the proposals. GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staffs will conduct this evaluation over the next two to three weeks to provide an initial ranking of the proposals to the TIP Development Committee (TDC) in March and a preliminary program can be provided to the Planning Committee for consideration at the April 11 meeting.

(a.) Strategic Transportation Enhancements Program (STEP)

Daniel Hallowell reported that NYSDOT's STEP program is intended to provide investments in transportation infrastructure beyond demand response, preservation, and renewal. Dan described the regional project selection process in which each of the state's DOT regions can submit up to five projects. He reported that the five projects designated for submission in Region 4 include: (1) the I-390/I-490 interchange upgrade; (2) the new I-390/NYS Route 15A interchange; (3) the Erie Canal bridge improvement initiative; (4) the Inner Loop East project; and (5) infrastructure development for the Science, Technology, and Advanced Manufacturing Park (STAMP) in Genesee County.

Todd Gadd asked when NYSDOT was expected to announce the projects selected for funding through the "Beyond Preservation" program. Richard Perrin responded that this announcement was scheduled for January, but then STEP was announced. Daniel Hallowell noted that he expects the Beyond Preservation and STEP projects to be announced together.

Bill Wright asked about NYSDOT's process for STEP. Daniel Hallowell replied that NYSDOT regional offices would each submit up to five projects and NYSDOT-Main Office would make the final decision about which projects are selected to receive funding. He explained that projects selected will be those that demonstrate that they are strategic transportation investments that promote economic competitiveness, livability, and system connectivity to optimize the State's multi-modal transportation system and integrate sustainability's "triple bottom line." Projects must occur along corridors (state, regional, or local) that link and provide access to critical destinations. Proposals will receive priority consideration if they leverage investments from other public and/or private sources.

Bill Wright asked if the STEP projects must be National Highway System (NHS) projects. Dan Hallowell responded in the negative. Terry Rice asked if there was ever a formal call for projects for STEP. Dan Hallowell replied that there was not a formal call for projects but that the program was discussed at the January TDC meeting.

Terry Rice questioned whether or not the state disliked the projects proposed through the Statewide Prioritization Program and if STEP was a way for the state to get new projects to consider. He asked which of the region's proposed STEP projects were included in the regional economic development plan. Richard Perrin responded that the I-390/I-490 interchange, NYS Route 15A/I-390 interchange, and STAMP projects are included in the regional economic

development plan. Erik Frisch added that the Inner Loop East project is also included in the regional economic development plan.

Jim Fletcher asked if the STEP projects mean that the region is competing for its own dollars. Richard Perrin explained that funds that were previously distributed to regions for programming to projects that are now included in a statewide pot for programming to projects by NYSDOT-Main Office. In effect, each region is competing for not only its own dollars but also against other regions for a share of theirs.

c. Reports on UPWP Activities

GTC

Richard Perrin reported:

- Strategic Planning: GTC staff has reviewed the FHWA Notice regarding the Establishment of the National Freight Network that was published on February 6 (and corrected on February 13). GTC staff is continuing to participate in the development of the Finger Lakes Regional Sustainability Plan.
- Regional Traffic Count Collection: The current component of the program will be presented to the Planning Committee later in the meeting.
- LRTP Update/Implementation: A transportation system status report that provides updated data for the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region 2035 (LRTP 2035)* performance measures and the activities accomplished since the adoption of the *LRTP 2035* is being developed for presentation to the GTC Board in June 2013, the midway point between the adoptions of the *LRTP 2035* and *LRTP 2040*.
- Air Quality Planning and Outreach: GTC staff participated in the Genesee Region Clean Communities' workshop for their Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) Program-funded project on January 10 and the February 13 New York State Association of Metropolitan Planning Organizations' Climate Change Workgroup teleconference.
- GTC Household Travel Survey: The project was accepted by the GTC Board at its September 17 meeting.
- Diversion Route Planning Initiative: De facto diversion routes (i.e., those that drivers are most likely to use in the event of a facility being closed) based on information from the GTC Travel Demand Model will be finalized at the February 28 meeting of Steering Committee. GTC staff is identifying potential options for presenting the preferred diversion routes.
- Priority Trails Advancement: The project is complete.
- Congestion Management Process (CMP): The update of the CMP is included in the *LRTP 2035* that was adopted by the Board on June 16, 2011. A CMP report that expands on the information included in the *LRTP 2035* was reviewed and discussed by the Transportation Management Committee at its January 15

meeting. The report is being finalized by GTC staff based on the comments received.

- Greater Rochester Regional Commuter Choice Program: The program was accepted by the GTC Board at its September 17 meeting. GTC staff continues to administer the website and make modifications as necessary to improve users' experience.
- Travel Time Data Collection Program: The contract with the preferred vendor (INRIX) has been executed and GTC staff is working towards delivery of data for the first of the two years included in the contract.
- Coordinated Public Transit/Human Services Transportation Planning: The plan was accepted by the Board at the September 8, 2011 meeting.
- Regional Mobility Management Business Plan: GTC staff is developing a revised Request for Proposals (RFP) package to comply with requirements that FTA has provided to NYSDOT and are applicable to sub-recipients.
- Regional Goods Movement Strategy: The plan was accepted by the Board at the September 17 meeting.

Genesee County

Tim Hens reported:

- Genesee County Horizontal Curve Sign Study: A report is being finalized and will likely be presented to the Planning Committee within a couple of months.

G/FLRPC

David Zorn reported:

- Regional Land Use Monitoring Report: Surveys have been distributed to communities, and data are being compiled.
- Genesee-Finger Lakes Region Population Projections: Meetings with counties are finished and projections are being adjusted based on those meetings.
- Regional Atlas: Data are being double-checked and layout of the publication is in design/formatting stage.

Livingston County

Angela Ellis reported:

- Livingston County Transportation Connectivity Plan: Revised existing conditions report is expected any day, and a needs assessment is due in March. Results of the various surveys are being tabulated and a second public meeting will be scheduled soon.

Monroe County

Tom Goodwin reported:

- Monroe County Land Use Monitoring Report: Surveys to municipalities have been distributed; about half have been returned.

Terry Rice reported:

- Monroe County Sign Inventory Location Upgrade: The consultant has completed reconciliation of identified data anomalies. The data has been incorporated into the Hansen database. Presentation of the project is expected at the April Planning Committee meeting.
- Monroe County Horizontal Curve Study: This project is complete. The Executive Summary will be presented later in the meeting.
- Monroe County High Accident Location Program: No change since the last meeting; 36 out of 54 total targeted locations have been completed (67 percent).
- Monroe County Accident Rate Database GIS Conversion: This project is complete. The Executive Summary will be presented later in the meeting.

Ontario County

Bill Wright reported:

- Routes 5 & 20 and State Route 364 Multi-Modal Study: No new activity to report; existing conditions still being reviewed.

City of Rochester

Erik Frisch reported:

- Center City Tourist/Visitor Circulation and Pedestrian Wayfinding Study: The study is complete.
- City of Rochester Urban Trail Linkages Feasibility Study: Project is expected to be presented to the Planning Committee for consideration in April.
- Susan B. Anthony Neighborhood Parking and Circulation Study: The study is complete.
- St. Paul and North Clinton Two-Way Conversion Study: Project was presented to the Planning Committee at the January 10 meeting.
- Rochester Bicycle Boulevard Plan: RFP is under development.
- Mt. Read Boulevard Corridor Study: Project kickoff meeting is scheduled for March 7.

Daniel Hallowell commented that he was not aware of a scheduled meeting for the Mt. Read Boulevard study. Erik Frisch said that David Goehring (NYSDOT-Region 4) was invited.

RGRTA

David Cook reported:

- RGRTA Suburban Transit Station Study: The study is complete.
- RTS Signal Prioritization Study: The Executive Summary is expected to be presented to the GTC Board for consideration in March.
- RGRTA Transit-Supportive Development Guidelines: A draft report is being reviewed by independent engineers. The project is expected to be completed in the second quarter of calendar year 2013.
- RGRTA Route Analysis: The project is ongoing. The current focus is on increasing the productivity of select routes.

Wayne County

Kevin Rooney reported:

- Wayne County Horizontal Curve Sign Study: The Executive Summary is expected to be presented to the Planning Committee for consideration at its April meeting.

Wyoming County

Todd Gadd reported:

- Wyoming County Horizontal Curve Sign Study: Executive summary is expected to be presented to the Planning Committee for consideration in April.

Yates County

David Hartman reported:

- Yates County Safe Passing Zone Survey: The study is complete.

Other Agencies

Richard Perrin reported:

- Auburn Trail Connection to the Ontario Pathways Trail: The final report has been revised and is expected to be presented to the Planning Committee at the April 11 meeting.
- Irondequoit Seneca Multi-Use Trail Feasibility Study: A meeting was held between the Town and Monroe County Parks on February 1 to review potential alignments.
- Black Creek Stream Corridor Trail Feasibility Study: The final report is being revised and is expected to be presented to the Planning Committee at the April 11 meeting.

- Village of Scottsville Traffic Circulation and Safety Study: The Steering Committee met on January 30 and the existing conditions report has been drafted along with the technical appendices.
- Webster Village Core Circulation, Accessibility, and Parking Study: An economic development roundtable was held January 29, the first public meeting was held on February 6 to gather information on existing conditions and needs, and a Steering Committee meeting was held on February 13.
- Victor Transportation Systems Plan: The Town and Village boards met on February 5 to review the results of the transportation component of the comprehensive plan and the follow-on activities conducted with the remaining UPWP funds.
- NYS Route 250 Transit Supportive Mixed Use Development District: The Town Board approved the expansion of the Steering Committee to include additional members and the Steering Committee met on January 22 and February 5.
- Brighton Bicycle and Pedestrian Trail Plan: The plan has been completed and was adopted by the Town Board on January 23. A presentation to the Planning Committee is expected at the April 11 meeting.
- Town of Greece Active Transportation Plan: A Project Advisory Committee has been formed and the kickoff meeting scheduled for February 11 was postponed and will be rescheduled.
- Village of Pittsford Active Transportation Safety Plan: No progress to report.

5. Action Items

- a. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **adopting the Draft *FY 2013-2014 Unified Planning Work Program Project List for public review***

Richard Perrin reported that the draft *FY 2013-2014 Unified Planning Work Program* project list was approved for public review at the January 10 Planning Committee meeting. It was made available for public review from January 11 through February 11 on the GTC website and at the GTC office, county planning offices, the NYSDOT-Region 4 office, and the central repository libraries in the Rochester Transportation Management Area counties. No public comments were received.

As no public comments were received, the draft UPWP document that has been provided to the Planning Committee represents the program provided for public review via the draft project list. Richard informed the Planning Committee that:

1. The draft UPWP document includes several projects for which the technical work will likely be completed before the program becomes effective on April 1. These projects will be removed from the draft UPWP document upon confirmation by the lead agency that the technical work has been completed and the federal transportation planning funds have been expended.
2. Federal Highway Administration Metropolitan Planning (PL) funds have been added to Task 5500 – Bicycle and Pedestrian Transportation Program to

support the 2013 Active Transportation Symposium (\$4,000) and to Task 5900 – Transportation System Management and Operations Planning (\$7,000) to conduct traffic incident management training for transportation agencies, law enforcement personnel, and other first responders.

3. GTC staff has received notification from the New York State Energy and Research Development Authority (NYSERDA) that it is interested in pursuing our proposal for the Rochester Area Bike Sharing Program Study, Task 8780. The project is currently programmed with \$75,000 of FHWA PL funds in the draft UPWP. GTC submitted a proposal for \$100,000 to NYSERDA for the project, recognizing that NYSERDA will require additional analysis (specifically, regarding projected greenhouse gas emission reductions). If NYSERDA accepts the proposal as submitted by GTC staff, \$25,000 of FHWA PL funds will be used to match \$75,000 in NYSERDA funds. At this time, the project will remain as programmed in the draft UPWP until the contract with NYSERDA is finalized.

Richard stated that GTC staff will conduct a full editorial review prior to mailing the draft UPWP to the GTC Board.

Scott Leathersich asked what would happen to the UPWP funds proposed for the Bike Sharing Program Study if the NYSERDA grant comes through. Richard Perrin replied that those funds will be reprogrammed to Task 1600 – Program Reserve and be made available for programming in the *FY 2014-2015 UPWP*.

James Fletcher moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt the *FY 2013-2014 Unified Planning Work Program*, Terry Rice seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

- b. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **accepting reports as evidence of completion of various UPWP Tasks** / Proposed Council Resolutions 13-4 through 13-6

Bill Wright proposed grouping consideration of Resolutions 13-4 through 13-6 for consideration under a single motion. No Member or Alternate objected.

1. Action concerning **recommending the acceptance of the *Monroe County 2012 Count Program Summary* as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 4370** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-4 (Monroe County)

Terry Rice summarized the project and process of developing it, noting that the study focused on roads in Monroe County, including the City of Rochester, that were not counted by NYSDOT through the Highway Performance Monitoring System.

Richard Perrin said that conducting counts in counties outside of Monroe County should be considered in the *FY 2014-15 UPWP*. He asked about the performance of the consultants. Jim Pond replied that the consultants were generally good,

although a few of their practices which were allowable in the project specifications generated public complaints.

Dan Hallowell asked if any classification counts were registered. Jim Pond responded in the affirmative, stating that samples were taken on roads where there was a need to determine the number of trucks.

2. Action concerning **recommending the acceptance of the *Monroe County Department of Transportation Horizontal Curve Sign Study as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 6225* / Proposed Council Resolution 13-5 (Monroe County)**

Brent Penwarden summarized the study, noting that the findings comply with the most current federal and state guidelines.

Jim Fletcher asked if there were any cost estimates for installing signs as recommended in the report. Brent Penwarden replied that the study did not include estimates but that sign installations will cost approximately \$630,000, using in-house resources and labor.

David Cook asked if there was a deadline for implementing the recommendations. Brent Penwarden explained that the county must have a plan in place to evaluate the useful life of signs and replace them as their lifecycle ends. The signs will be brought into compliance of the new standards dependent on funding.

Paul Holahan asked if federal or state guidance had changed since the study was conducted or was expected to change in the foreseeable future. Brent Penwarden explained that there were no guidance changes since the data was collected and that he had no indication of upcoming changes.

3. Action concerning **recommending the acceptance of the migration of existing accident data for Monroe County roadways to a Geographic Information Systems-based network and the associated data files as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 6231** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-6 (Monroe County)

Jim Pond summarized the project, explaining that its purpose was to restore compatibility between the county accident database and the New York State Accident Location Information System.

James McIntosh asked if the new system links old data with the new. Jim Pond said that the new system contains data from 2008 to present, but that older data is still retrievable.

Bill Wright moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-4, 13-5, and 13-6; Kevin Rooney seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

- c. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 Transportation Improvement Program** / Proposed Council Resolutions 13-7 through 13-49

Richard Perrin reported that the 43 amendments and two administrative modifications provided for Planning Committee consideration were recommended by the TIP Development Committee at its January 31 meeting.

In addition to the amendments and administrative modifications considered by the Planning Committee, the TDC also tasked GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staffs with identifying projects to use the unprogrammed funds in the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program (CMAQ) and Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) Block Programs projects included in the *2011-2014 TIP*. Both programs have strict eligibility requirements in terms of the types of projects for which funds from the programs can be obligated to. These items will be considered after the proposed TIP resolutions and administrative modifications that were included in the mailing for the meeting.

Bill Wright suggested that the TIP amendments be grouped so that multiple resolutions could be considered under a single action. Scott Leathersich proposed considering the proposed council resolutions in the following groups:

4. Resolutions 13-7 through 13-12;
5. Resolutions 13-2 and 13-3;
6. Resolutions 13-13 through 13-17;
7. Resolution 13-18;
8. Resolutions 13-19 through 13-26;
9. Resolutions 13-27 through 13-29;
10. Resolution 13-30;
11. Resolutions 13-31 through 13-32;
12. Resolutions 13-33 through 13-44 and Resolution 13-46;
13. Resolution 13-45;
14. Resolutions 13-47 through 13-49.

No Member or Alternate objected.

1. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of the Highway Bridge Block Program project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-7 (NYSDOT)
2. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of and deferring a portion of a phase of the Edgewood Avenue Bridge over Allens Creek project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-8 (Monroe County)
3. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Twin Bridge Road over Oatka Creek and**

Oatka Creek Tributary project / Proposed Council Resolution 13-9
(Monroe County)

4. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Corwin Road Bridge Preventive Maintenance project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-10 (Town of Brighton)
5. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Collamer Road Bridge over West Creek project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-11 (Town of Parma)
6. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Scott Crescent Bridge over Millrace project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-12 (Village of Scottsville)

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolutions 13-7 through 13-12. He explained that Proposed Council Resolutions 13-7 and 13-8 decreased the costs for bridge projects and Proposed Council Resolutions 13-9 through 13-12 applied those decreases to cost increases on the other bridge projects.

Bill Wright moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-7 through 13-12; Terry Rice seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

7. Action concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of the Paul Road-Fisher Road Corridor Improvements - Phase 1 project** / Proposed Planning Committee Resolution 13-2 (Monroe County)
8. Action concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Paul Road-Fisher Road Corridor Improvements - Phase 2 project** / Proposed Planning Committee Resolution 13-3 (Monroe County)

Richard Perrin discussed Planning Committee Resolutions 13-2 and 13-3. He explained that these proposed resolutions will amend two projects to reprogram earmarked funds with no impact on any other projects.

Bill Wright moved to recommend approval of Planning Committee Resolutions 13-2 and 13-3; Jim Fletcher seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

9. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of and renaming the Caswell Road Railroad Crossing project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-13 (NYSDOT)
10. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by deleting the Beaver Meadow Road Railroad Crossing project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-14 (NYSDOT)

11. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of and renaming the Ivson Road Railroad Crossing project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-15 (NYSDOT)
12. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by Amending the 2011-2014 TIP by deleting the Dublin Road Railroad Crossing project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-16 (NYSDOT)
13. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Maple St. CSX Rail Crossing project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-17 (NYSDOT)

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolutions 13-13 through 13-17, explaining that that these proposed amendments represent modest changes to five NYSDOT railroad crossing projects.

Terry Rice moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-13 through 13-17; Tim Hens seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

14. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by deferring a phase of the Route 531 Interchange at Rt. 31 and Rt. 36 - Reconstruction project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-18 (NYSDOT)

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolution 13-18. The source of funds is an earmark that cannot be used for other projects.

Bill Wright moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolution 13-18; Dan Hallowell seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

15. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding Highway Safety Improvement Program funds to and reprogramming portions of select phases of the I-390 Interchange Improvements @ Rt. 15 (Exit 16 Part 2) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-19 (NYSDOT)
16. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the I-390 Concrete Pavement Restoration in Groveland, Geneseo and Avon project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-20 (NYSDOT)
17. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the I-490 Ramp to Rt 96 Bridge over I-490 project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-21 (NYSDOT)
18. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by reinstating the Interstate System Preventive Maintenance (2014) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-22 (NYSDOT)

19. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Interstate Overhead Sign Structure Improvement (2012) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-23 (NYSDOT)
20. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Regional Traffic Operations Center Staffing project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-24 (NYSDOT)
21. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the I-390 Interchange Improvements @ Rt. 15A (Exit 16 Part 1) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-25 (NYSDOT)
22. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by Amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Routes 5&20 in Geneva project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-26 (NYSDOT)

John Polimeni discussed Proposed Resolutions 13-19 through 13-26. He explained that these proposed amendments are related to an additional \$8.3 million in HSIP funds that were awarded by NYSDOT-Main Office based on a statewide solicitation. These funds were applied to the I-390/NYS Route 15A interchange project, which make National Highway Performance Program (NHPP) funds available.

Jim Fletcher asked if projects other than those proposed by NYSDOT should be considered for programming with the NHPP funds that are being made available. Richard Perrin explained that the NHPP funds can only be used on National Highway System facilities and the majority of these roadways and the bridges they carry are owned by NYSDOT. In addition, sponsors are expected to identify their own offsets and that is what NYSDOT is doing. Dan Hallowell emphasized that the HSIP funds were provided by NYSDOT-Main Office for the project they are being proposed to be programmed to.

Tim Hens moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-19 through 13-26; Erick Frisch seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

23. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by Amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the Monroe County Countdown Pedestrian Indication Program project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-27 (Monroe County)
24. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the Centerline Audible Roadway Delineator Installation project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-28 (NYSDOT)

25. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the *2011-2014 TIP* by adding the NYSDOT Pedestrian Countdown Timer Installation project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-29 (NYSDOT)

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolutions 13-27 through 13-29. He explained that these proposed amendments are new projects that will be added using HSIP funds that are being awarded by NYSDOT-Main Office through the same solicitation that awarded HSIP funds to the I-390/15A interchange project.

Bill Wright moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-27 through 13-29; Terry Rice seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

26. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the *2011-2014 TIP* by Amending the *2011-2014 TIP* by adding Eight Safe Routes to School Program projects consistent with the Regional Project Priorities List project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-30 (NYSDOT)

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolution 13-30. He noted that the projects to receive Safe Routes to School funds were selected by NYSDOT-Main Office through a solicitation and evaluation that included significant input by GTC and that the projects selected by NYSDOT-Main Office follow the order that the GTC Board endorsed at its December 13, 2012 meeting.

Jim Fletcher moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolution 13-30; Dan Hallowell seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

27. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the *2011-2014 TIP* by increasing the cost of and renaming the South Clinton Avenue Preventive Maintenance project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-31 (City of Rochester)

28. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the *2011-2014 TIP* by decreasing the cost of and deferring phases of the Crittenden Boulevard Preventive Maintenance project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-32 (City of Rochester)

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolutions 13-31 and 13-32. He explained that both proposed amendments address City of Rochester projects, and that the City has identified its own offset for the cost increase on the South Clinton Avenue Preventive Maintenance project.

Bill Wright moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-31 and 13-32; Kevin Rooney seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

29. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of the Replace 25 Transit Buses (FFY 2012) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-33 (RGRTA)
30. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of the Replace 13 Articulated Transit Buses (FY 2012) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-34 (RGRTA)
31. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of the Purchase 18 Lift Line Buses (FFY 2012) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-35 (RGRTA)
32. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of the Purchase 18 Lift Line Buses (FFY 2013) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-36 (RGRTA)
33. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Replace 19 RTS Buses (FFY 2013) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-37 (RGRTA)
34. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by deleting the RGRTA Software for Claims and Workers Compensation project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-38 (RGRTA)
35. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Preventive Maintenance (2013) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-39 (RGRTA)
36. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the RGRTA Site and Facility Improvements project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-40 (RGRTA)
37. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the RGRTA Grants Administration (2013) project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-41 (RGRTA)
38. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the RGRTA Financial Software Replacement - Phase II project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-42 (RGRTA)
39. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the RGRTA Interactive Voice Response Software Replacement project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-43 (RGRTA)
40. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the Lift Line Appointment Verification System project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-44 (RGRTA)

42. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the Lift Line Facility Improvements project / Proposed Council Resolution 13-46 (RGRTA)**

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolutions 13-33 through 13-44 and 13-46. He explained that these proposed amendments will align the TIP with the most recent version of the RGRTA capital program and involve funds available only to RGRTA (FTA Sections 5307 and 5339), not other member agencies.

David Cook moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-33 through 13-44 and Resolution 13-46; Tom Goodwin seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

41. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the Two-way Conversion of St. Paul St. & North Clinton Ave. project / Proposed Council Resolution 13-45 (RGRTA)**

David Cook discussed Proposed Council Resolution 13-45. He explained that the two-way conversion of St. Paul Street and Clinton Avenue project is being amended because RGRTA secured discretionary funds and these funds will be administered by the City of Rochester.

Terry Rice moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolution 13-45; Erik Frisch seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

43. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by decreasing the cost of the Highway Safety Improvement Block Program project / Proposed Council Resolution 13-47 (Ontario and Wyoming Counties)**

44. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the High Risk Rural Road Improvement in Wyoming County project / Proposed Council Resolution 13-48 (Wyoming County)**

45. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by increasing the cost of the High Risk Rural Road Improvement in Ontario County project / Proposed Council Resolution 13-49 (Ontario County)**

Richard Perrin discussed Proposed Council Resolutions 13-47 through 13-49. He explained that funds from the Highway Safety Improvement Block Program are being proposed to provide offsets for cost increases on the High Risk Rural Road Improvement projects in Ontario and Wyoming counties.

Dan Hallowell moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolutions 13-47 through 13-49; Jim Fletcher seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

46. Recommendation to the GTC Board concerning **amending the 2011-2014 TIP by adding the FFY 2011 JARC Program for WATS project** / Proposed Council Resolution 13-50 (RGRTA)

David Cook explained that this award will help fund Wayne Area Transportation Service (WATS) operations that enable low-income individuals to travel to and from jobs. Wayne County will match the federal funds. Paul Holahan asked if the JARC funds will be used to create new transit routes. David Cook replied the JARC funds will be used to support existing WATS routes.

David Cook moved to recommend that the GTC Board adopt Council Resolution 13-50; Erik Frisch seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

As discussed earlier, Richard Perrin reported that the region has funds available in the Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) and Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ) blocks. Both fund sources have very specific eligibility requirements which limit the types of projects that they can be programmed to.

GTC staff solicited HSIP-eligible projects from the City of Rochester and counties in the TIP area. Nine proposals were received. GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staff reviewed the proposals to: 1) determine if they are eligible to have HSIP funds obligated for project costs and 2) evaluate the likelihood that the proposals will eliminate or reduce fatalities and personal injuries from crashes if implemented. Richard distributed a sheet presenting the GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staffs rankings of the projects.

Terry Rice asked why the Monroe County Horizontal Curve Sign proposal was not included on the list. Richard Perrin replied it was an oversight by GTC staff. That proposal came as an application for the *2014-2017 TIP* and was never forwarded to NYSDOT. Richard apologized for not including that project in the evaluation process;

A general discussion of eligibility for safety funds and possible ways of improving eligibility ensued. Richard Perrin asked if the Planning Committee was comfortable with the HSIP evaluation process; general consensus was affirmative.

Terry Rice offered to defer consideration of the Monroe County Horizontal Curve Sign proposal to the *2011-2014 TIP* development process so that other projects could be funded with the FFY 2013 and 2014 HSIP funds.

Bill Wright moved to recommend that the GTC Board add the proposed HSIP projects to the 2011-2014 TIP. Dan Hallowell seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

With respect to the CMAQ Block Program project, GTC staff developed scenarios for TDC consideration. These incorporated the current status of Mt. Hope Station. The TDC was unable to come to unanimous agreement on the projects to which these funds should be programmed to. Richard distributed a sheet detailing two scenarios

discussed by the TDC and explained them. Both scenarios include funds for the Highland Park/Canalway Connector Trail, which had CMAQ funding removed from it in the December 2011 revision to the *2011-2014 TIP*. Scenario A provides the maximum amount of CMAQ funding available to Renaissance Square, allowing Surface Transportation Program-Flex (STP-Flex) to be available to other projects (including cost overruns already identified by project sponsors). The ability to obligate CMAQ funds to any project (in this case, Renaissance Square) is dependent on review by and approval from NYSDOT and FHWA-NY Division. Scenario B provides a smaller amount of CMAQ funds to Renaissance Square with the remainder programmed to the Regional Transit Service (RTS) Bus Replacement project, which had CMAQ funding removed from it in the December 2011 revision to the *2011-2014 TIP*.

A general discussion of the two scenarios took place. David Cook discussed the region's tradition of supporting a balanced approach to funding different transportation modes and stated that Scenario B provides that balance. Angela Ellis asked if any of the replacement buses would be for RGRTA's regional subsidiaries. David Cook replied that all these buses would be for RTS operations. Richard Perrin added that the models of buses used in the non-RTS fleets are not eligible for CMAQ because the life cycle of the buses is short and newer models don't provide significant reductions in emissions because engine efficiency and pollution control technology don't improve much by the time the vehicles are due for replacement.

Terry Rice stated that the major reason for requiring the reprogramming is because the Mt. Hope Station project is not advancing. Terry observed that all member agencies are dealing with a smaller pot for highway and bridge projects, and asserted that Scenario A would provide more flexibility and help more agencies. He noted that Monroe County has highway reconstruction project needs that he did not submit for consideration in the *2014-2017 TIP* because of known funding constraints.

Paul Holahan asked whether or not RGRTA would extend its bus replacement schedule if it does not have all the funds it needs to buy buses. David Cook replied that the schedule would not be changed. Paul asked what precisely RGRTA would have to do without if it does not obtain all of the CMAQ funds. David Cook replied that he could not respond without having RGRTA's full capital program before him. David again stated that the question before the Planning Committee was one of ensuring a balanced transportation system.

Jim Fletcher asked if the region would lose the CMAQ funds if nothing is done. Richard Perrin replied in the affirmative. He explained that Scenario A would not mean more money is available for new projects, but rather that additional funds could be applied to existing projects by swapping CMAQ (limited eligibility) for STP-Flex (broad eligibility).

Paul Holahan reiterated that the Mt. Hope Station project was important to the City, but without a final cost and schedule, it is difficult to ignore pressing and immediate needs elsewhere.

Bill Wright moved to recommend that the GTC Board amend the 2011-2014 TIP to advance Scenario A; Terry Rice seconded the motion.

David Cook proposed a new scenario that would split the funds in question between what Scenarios A and B propose. Erik Frisch proposed that \$4.6 million, which would be sufficient to cover known cost overruns in the current TIP, be dedicated to a "want list" and \$600,000 dedicated to the RGRTA bus replacement project. Committee members did not support either David Cook's or Erik Frisch's proposals.

Jim Fletcher moved to amend the motion as introduced with the scenario proposed by Erik Frisch; Erik Frisch seconded the motion to amend. The motion to amend failed with eight ayes and nine nays.

Bill Wright's motion to recommend that the GTC Board amend the 2011-2014 TIP to advance Scenario A passed with 17 ayes and one nay.

6. New Business

Richard Perrin informed the Planning Committee that GTC staff has had discussions with local elected officials in Genesee and other counties about the implications of the current levels of investment in transportation infrastructure at the federal and state levels. Based on feedback, there is interest in pursuing potential revenue options. At this time, GTC staff feels that the best approach is to present the needs in a manner that allows the general public, business organizations, and others to determine that additional revenues are needed rather than proposing means for providing additional revenues for transportation. The current update to the TIP presents this opportunity. Given the projected shortfall in funding compared to revenues, GTC staff is focusing on preparing materials that demonstrate the consequences of continued underinvestment. Richard requested suggestions from the Planning Committee on how best to continue this initiative.

Dave Zorn provided an update on the status of the Regional Sustainability Plan. He reported that the baseline assessment is available on the project website and encouraged the Planning Committee members to review it. He discussed the Strategy Capture Forms that are also available on the project website and encouraged those present to use the forms to suggest projects that could be considered for inclusion in the plan. He reviewed the project schedule, including upcoming public meetings and the remaining deliverables.

Don Higgins stated that he has three bridge preventive maintenance projects for which the engineers' estimates substantially exceed the amounts programmed in the TIP. Richard Perrin noted that the Highway Bridge Block Program project has a positive balance in FFY 2014 and may be a possibility for additional funding for these projects.

Bill Wright stated that the New York State County Highway Superintendent's Association has asked the NYSDOT Commissioner to clarify her comments that the level of federal funding available to local transportation agencies is not changing between the Safe

Accountable Flexible Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users and Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century transportation legislation. The association has not received a reply.

7. Public Forum

No one from the public spoke during the public forum.

8. Next Meeting

April 11, 2013 at Ontario County Municipal Building
20 Ontario Street
Canandaigua, NY

All materials for items to be considered at this meeting should be submitted to GTC staff no later than Friday, March 29, 2013.

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 12:59 p.m.