

**GENESEE TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING
Rochester Genesee Regional Transportation Authority
1372 East Main Street, Rochester**

October 10, 2013

PLANNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT

Marcia Barry, Rochester City Planning Commission
Angela Ellis, Livingston County (Vice Chairperson)
James Fletcher, Monroe County – At Large
Erik Frisch, City of Rochester – At Large
Todd Gadd, Wyoming County
Thomas Goodwin, Monroe County Planning Board
Andrea Guzzetta, Rochester City Council
David Hartman, Yates County
Paul Holahan, City of Rochester
Scott Leathersich, Monroe County – At Large (Chairperson)
Terrence Rice, Monroe County
Kevin Rooney, Wayne County
Douglas J. Tokarczyk, NYS Thruway Authority
David Zorn, Genesee/Finger Lakes Regional Planning Council (G/FLRPC)

ALTERNATE REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT

David Cook, Rochester Genesee Regional Transportation Authority (RGRTA), representing Bill Carpenter
Christopher Reeve, NYSDOT-Region 4, representing Daniel Hallowell

PLANNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT AND UNREPRESENTED

Donald Allport, Orleans County
Carm Carmestro, Monroe County Supervisors' Association
Robert Colby, Monroe County
Timothy Hens, Genesee County
Edward Muszynski, Empire State Development Corporation
Mitchell Rowe, Seneca County
Steven Urlass, Federal Aviation Administration (FAA)
William Wright, Ontario County
(Vacant), Federal Highway Administration (FHWA)
(Vacant), Federal Transportation Administration (FTA)
(Vacant), NYS Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC)

OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE

Steve Beauvais, NYSDOT-Region 4	James Stack, GTC staff
Crystal Benjamin, RGRTA	Robert Torzynski, GTC staff
Anita Billings, Village of Perry	
Roy Gates, Seneca County	
Rick Hauser, Village of Perry	
Donald Higgins, Livingston County	
Dennis Judson, Fisher Associates	
Gerald Lederthiel, Citizen	
Thomas Lichtenthal, Town of Batavia	
Sharon Lilla, Barton & Loguidice	
Richard Perrin, GTC staff	
John Polimeni, NYSDOT-Region 4	

1. Call to Order & Introductions

Scott Leathersich, Planning Committee Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. David Cook, welcomed everyone to the meeting on behalf of RGRTA CEO Bill Carpenter, and offered to provide a tour of the RGRTA campus after the meeting to anyone that wished to participate. Members, Alternates, and others present introduced themselves.

2. Public Forum

Rick Hauser, Mayor of the Village of Perry, spoke to the Planning Committee about the Village's efforts, beginning with the completion of a Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP)-funded Circulation, Accessibility, and Parking (CAP) Study in 2008, to improve its streetscape including bicycle and pedestrian facilities. He noted that the CAP study has guided investments in the Village over the past five-plus years. The Mayor introduced Village Trustee Anita Billings, who is also working to advance these efforts. The mayor then discussed the proposal that the Village recently submitted for funding under the current and final round of the NYSDOT-administered Transportation Enhancements Program (TEP) program. He discussed private sector efforts that complement public sector efforts, noting that the Perry is a model for village revitalization.

Mayor Hauser expressed his enthusiasm to see the proposal rank relatively high on the Regional Project Priorities List but indicated that he was disappointed because it was his understanding that available funding would not be sufficient to fund it. He encouraged the Planning Committee to keep projects like the Village proposal in mind going forward if additional funding opportunities became available.

Richard Perrin added that Perry's was the first CAP study in the region and became the model for subsequent ones. He added that Mayor Hauser was the champion of the CAP study as it was conducted.

3. Approval of Minutes

David Cook moved for approval of the minutes from the August 8, 2013 Planning Committee meeting; Tom Goodwin seconded the motion. The minutes were approved as presented.

Scott Leathersich suggested that item 5.a. be moved forward in the agenda out of courtesy to the guests. No Member or Alternate objected.

5. Action Items

- a. Action concerning endorsing the Regional Project Priorities List for the 2013 round of the Transportation Enhancements Program / Proposed Planning Committee Resolution 13-4

Richard Perrin provided a report on the background of the NYSDOT-administered TEP as well as an overview of its replacement in Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century (MAP-21) via the Transportation Alternatives Program (TAP), which combines the TEP, Recreational Trails Program, and the Safe Routes to School Program with a an approximately 35 percent reduction in total funding. Richard gave an overview of the evaluation process and the schedule followed for the 2013 round of the TEP program. He noted that the evaluation timeline set by NYSDOT-Main Office for the 2013 TEP round does not provide enough time for the GTC Board to review the Planning Committee endorsement of the Regional Priorities List, as has been done in previous funding rounds. Announcements by NYSDOT-Main Office regarding projects to be funded are expected by the end of the calendar year. Accordingly, the Planning Committee's Proposed Resolution 13-4, will, as approved, be transmitted to NYSDOT-Main Office and will be considered final with respect to this funding round (i.e., the GTC Board will take no action on the recommendation). Richard noted that the GTC Board was informed of the necessity for this approach at its September 12, 2013 Meeting.

Steve Beauvais discussed some of the key criteria that influence the scoring for the TEP projects. These include, but are not limited to, "Enhancement of the Local and Regional Environment", "Environmental Benefits", and "Preliminary or Pre-Construction Activities Undertaken or Completed Prior to Submission of the Application." Steve also discussed the "Ability to Deliver Project" criteria and how it affects the evaluation of proposals from project sponsors with, and without, prior experience implementing federally-funded transportation projects.

Terry Rice commented that due to changes to the funding guidelines affecting TIP projects, there were a number of potentially TEP-eligible projects that were redirected toward TEP funding this round, increasing the pressure on the limited TEP funding available to the region. Terry added that a number of this year's project sponsors could have taken advantage of county highway departments' knowledge of delivering federally-funded projects to potentially improve their applications (in relation to the Ability to Deliver Project rating criteria discussed above).

Terry commented that the TEP funds requested and the local matching funds for the Highland Crossing Trail project on the Draft Regional Priorities List Table are less than the total project cost. Richard Perrin clarified that the total project cost includes Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Program (CMAQ) funds (and associated local matching funds) already programmed to the project.

James Fletcher stated that, in his opinion, smaller agencies are being shut out of the TEP process because their lack of experience with Federal Aid projects affects their score on the Ability to Deliver Project criteria. He noted the Catch 22 in that they can't score better if they don't have the opportunity to receive federal transportation funds through the TIP or TEP. Richard Perrin commented that this criteria is one of many used in the evaluation and is not necessarily the deciding factor when the rest of the scoring criteria are considered. Terry Rice commented that some of these projects may qualify for other funding sources such as the Highway Safety Improvement Program. Steve Beauvais noted, in regards to the deliverability criteria,

that some states will not even allow sponsors that had issues with a prior Federal Aid project to apply for TEP funding.

Todd Gadd asked what happens to the funds programmed to TEP projects that do not advance. Steve Beauvais responded that these funds are returned to NYSDOT-Main Office and then redistributed to projects throughout the state.

Todd Gadd asked if there is an opportunity for something like an illustrative list of projects, as was done in the American Recover and Reinvestment Act. Richard Perrin responded that this list reflects the region's priority ranking of the proposed projects so, in effect, the projects that are not selected to receive funds are the illustrative list. As noted earlier, there is not a specific amount set aside for any region and NYSDOT-Main Office may select more or less projects in the region than we expect.

Tom Lichenthal asked about the TAP timeline. Richard Perrin noted that NYSDOT-Main Office is still developing the program and the associated timelines. MAP-21 has an allocation for large urban areas and our current estimate for the first TAP funding round is approximately \$480,000 for the Rochester Urbanized Area and NYSDOT-Main Office has purview over non-urban areas. Richard added that GTC staff and the other metropolitan planning organizations are working with NYSDOT on program guidance and rollout.

Erik Frisch moved to approve Planning Committee Resolution 13-4; Paul Holahan seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

4. Reports and Action on Old Business

a. Reports of UPWP Projects and Other Activities

GTC

Richard Perrin reported:

- GTC staff has begun the development of a strategic plan for 2014-2015 through 2016-2017. The plan will take six months to complete and was initiated in early-September. The plan will be organized around five Key Result Areas: Strategic Direction, Concept Development, Investment Decisions, Customer Engagement, and Internal Operations. GTC staff presented at an FHWA Workshop on Performance Based Planning and Programming on September 19 and 20. GTC staff has reviewed the FTA Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking on the National Public Transportation Safety Plan, Agency Safety Plan, Safety Certification Training Program, and Transit Asset Management that was issued on September 27, as well as the joint FHWA/FTA Proposed Policy Guidance on public transportation representation on MPO Boards that was issued on September 30. GTC staff participated on the initial teleconference of American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials subcommittee on MAP-21 performance management requirements on October 3. The joint NYS Association of Metropolitan Planning Organizations/NYSDOT MAP-21 workgroup held its initial meeting October 7.

- Regional Traffic Count Collection: There is no funding for additional counts in the *FY 2013-2014 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP)*, activities will be limited to analysis and dissemination of the data by GTC staff. GTC staff is working with county highway superintendents to develop a region wide proposal for the *FY 2014-2015 UPWP* and are coordinating with NYSDOT to ensure there is no duplication with their expanded Highway Performance Monitoring System (HPMS) submittal to FHWA.
- LRTP Update/Implementation: The development of a transportation system status report that provides updated data for the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region 2035 (LRTP 2035)* performance measures and the activities accomplished since the adoption of the *LRTP 2035* is continuing. Work activities include data analysis, amplification of relevant developments affecting *LRTP 2035* Emerging Opportunities and Issues, and document layout and design.
- Genesee-Finger Lakes Regional Critical Transportation Infrastructure Vulnerability Assessment: The draft Request for Proposals (RFP) has been distributed to member agencies and other stakeholders for their review.
- Diversion Route Planning Initiative: GTC staff has drafted a response to the consultant's letter on how to proceed with the remainder of the project.
- Congestion Management Process (CMP): The update of the CMP is included in the *LRTP 2035* that was adopted by the Board on June 16, 2011. The *CMP Technical Documentation* report that expands on the information included in the *LRTP 2035* was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.
- Greater Rochester Regional Commuter Choice Program: GTC staff is continuing to promote the program website and will be submitting a *FY 2014-2015 UPWP* proposal to continue the website, as well as increase its marketing. GTC staff is also working with Heritage Christian Services and Medical Motor Service on the potential for using the site to coordinate rides provided by volunteer drivers of human service agencies.
- Travel Time Data Collection Program: NYSDOT, Monroe County, NYS Police, and GTC staff met to analyze travel time data from INRIX and volume/capacity data from the GTC Travel Demand Model as part of an incident management review of the July 8 crash on I-590 involving a tanker truck.
- Regional Mobility Management Business Plan: The RFP was advertised on August 9 with proposals due September 27. One proposal was received and is being reviewed by the consultant evaluation team to determine if the submitting firm is qualified to provide the requested professional services.
- Genesee-Finger Lakes Regional Trails Initiative Update: The RFP was advertised on September 27 with proposals due November 7.
- Rochester Area Bike Sharing Program Study: The RFP was advertised on August 9 with proposals due September 27. Three proposals were received and are being reviewed by the consultant evaluation team.

Genesee County

Richard Perrin reported:

- Genesee County Horizontal Curve Sign Study: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.

G/FLRPC

David Zorn reported:

- Regional Land Use Monitoring Report: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its September 12 meeting.
- Inventory and Mapping of Regional Zoning District Boundaries and Inventory of Land Use: Data and information review and municipal follow up are underway.
- Regional Rights-of-Way Study: An advisory committee has been formed and research and data collection are underway. The advisory group met via conference call.
- Genesee-Finger Lakes Region Population Projections: The project was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.
- Planning for Transportation and Climate Change: The initial draft has been provided to G/FLRPC Planning Coordination Committee members for review with a brief presentation at the Planning Coordination Meeting on October 4.
- Regional Atlas: Data acquisition and analysis in being finalized, initial layout and design, and draft section development are underway.

Livingston County

Angela Ellis reported:

- Dansville Transportation and Commercial & Industrial Access Study: Four proposals were received following the advertisement of the RFP. Consultant interviews were conducted on September 17 and a preferred consultant was selected. The County Board of Supervisors approved the selection on October 9 and project kick-off is anticipated in November.
- Livingston County Transportation Connectivity Plan: The consultant is continuing work with RGRTA on route analysis of Livingston Area Transportation Service for inclusion in the plan. A target date of November 19 has been set for a Public Meeting and committee review is anticipated by the end of the year.

Monroe County

Terry Rice reported:

- Monroe County High Accident Location Program: A new list of locations has been developed with 54 locations. Three sites (6 percent) have been analyzed.

Ontario County

Richard Perrin reported:

- Routes 5 & 20 and State Route 364 Multi-Modal Study: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its September 12 meeting.

City of Rochester

Erik Frisch reported:

- Urban Trail Linkages: The City has received Monroe County's comments on the draft report and hopes to have them addressed in time for consideration at the November Planning Committee meeting.
- JOSANA Trail Feasibility Study: No progress to report.
- Mt. Read Boulevard Corridor Study: An advisory committee meeting was held on September 12 to review the first technical report. An advisory committee meeting is anticipated for November in advance of the second public meeting which is anticipated for December.
- Rochester Bicycle Boulevard Plan: The project contract has been executed and the advisory committee will meet for the project kick-off meeting next week.

RGRTA

David Cook reported:

- RGRTA Transit-Supportive Development Guidelines: No progress to report.
- RGRTA Route Analysis: Crystal Benjamin will provide an update on this project later in the meeting.
- RTS Route Overhaul and Refinement Analysis: Crystal Benjamin will provide an update on this project later in the meeting.
- Bus Stop Optimization Study: The RFP was released and three proposals are under evaluation. The evaluation team is finalizing a recommendation to take to the RGRTA Board for approval on November 13.

Wayne County

Kevin Rooney reported:

- Wayne County Horizontal Curve Sign Study: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.

Wyoming County

Todd Gadd reported:

- Wyoming County Horizontal Curve Sign Study: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.

Other Agencies

Richard Perrin reported:

- Auburn Trail Connection to the Ontario Pathways Trail: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.
- Irondequoit Seneca Multi-Use Trail Feasibility Study: The study is being finalized based on comments received.
- Black Creek Stream Corridor Trail Feasibility Study: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.
- Village of Scottsville Traffic Circulation and Safety Study: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its September 12 meeting.
- Webster Village Core Circulation, Accessibility, and Parking Study: The Steering Committee met on August 21 and a joint Village-Town zoning advisory group met on September 19. Adoption-ready ordinances are being prepared and a Public Meeting is scheduled for October 30.
- East Rochester Transportation Improvement Study: Seven proposals were received by the August 16 deadline and interviews conducted with a shortlist of three firms on September 16 and 17. The contract with the preferred consultant has been executed and the first Steering Committee meeting has been scheduled for October 15.
- Victor Transportation Systems Plan: A public update to the Town Board on the Traffic Task Force's recommended alternatives has been scheduled for October 28. The project is expected to be provided for Planning Committee consideration at the November 14 meeting.
- NYS Route 250 Transit Supportive Mixed Use Development District: An initial, "50 percent" draft design manual has been completed with an initial review by stakeholders completed. The next draft will be an "80 percent" complete version. The project is expected to be presented to the Town Board by the end of December.
- Town of Penfield Transit Supportive Mixed Use Development District: The RFP has been finalized and will be advertised when the "80 percent" design manual for Task 8514 is complete.
- Brighton Bicycle and Pedestrian Trail Plan: The study was accepted by the GTC Board at its June 20 meeting.
- Town of Greece Active Transportation Plan: The Steering Committee conducted a bike tour on August 15 with needs assessment continuing to be progressed.
- Village of Pittsford Active Transportation Safety Plan: The RFP is being drafted for stakeholder review and GTC staff approval.
- Town of Chili Bicycle and Pedestrian Planning Study: The RFP is being drafted for stakeholder review and GTC staff approval.
- Town of Perinton Active Transportation Plan: The RFP is being drafted for stakeholder review and GTC staff approval.

b. Any Other Old Business or Announcements

1. *2014-2017 Transportation Improvement Program* (GTC staff)

i. Status of the *2014-2017 Statewide TIP* and related GTC actions

Richard Perrin reported that the *2014-2017 Statewide TIP (STIP)* has been approved by FHWA-NY Division and FTA-Region 2. NYSDOT has made it available in eSTIP – the electronic STIP management application – and GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staffs will work to incorporate the 20 amendments to the *2014-2017 TIP* that were approved by the GTC Board at its September 12 meeting.

Richard noted that, at the time of the September 12 meeting, it was not certain whether or not the *2014-2017 STIP* would be approved by October 1. Accordingly, the GTC Board passed Resolution 13-152, Amending FFY 2014 of the *2011-2014 TIP* consistent with the FFY 2014 component of the *2014-2017 TIP*, which would have allowed GTC and NYSDOT-Region 4 staffs to make the necessary changes in eSTIP to ensure that projects progress as programmed in the new TIP.

2. Action concerning recommending the acceptance of the *Urban Trail Linkages Eastman and Genesee Riverway Trails Planning and Preliminary Design Study* as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 6524 / Proposed Council Resolution 13-62 (City of Rochester)

Erik Frisch reported that, as discussed earlier in the meeting, Monroe County's comments on the report are under review and an update on the resolution of any issues identified by the county will be discussed at a future meeting.

3. Update and discussion on proposed federal legislation (GTC staff)

The Senate and House of Representatives have been unable to agree on a Continuing Resolution to extend appropriations into the current FFY, resulting in the first partial shutdown of the federal government in nearly 20 years. The impacts on transportation have been limited so far with most of the negative effects being felt by FTA. This is because FTA administrative expenses are paid out of a one-year discretionary appropriation. In the immediate term, FHWA is unaffected because contract authority for FFY 2014 was created in MAP-21 and FHWA administrative expenses are a set-aside from the main budget account. The limiting factor is the amount of "liquidating cash" available to FHWA; the amount of which is currently unknown. Given that the partial shutdown could easily extend to at least next Thursday when the deadline for raising the debt ceiling deadline arrives (i.e., the fiscal cliff), the amount of available cash from the Highway Trust Fund for FHWA to pay obligations could run out.

4. Revised GTC Boundaries based on the 2010 Census (GTC staff)

At its September 12 meeting, the GTC Board passed Resolution 13-150, Updating the Rochester Adjusted Urbanized Area Boundary based on the 2010 Census, which revised this boundary consistent with the Planning Committee's recommendation and did so within the timeframe requested by NYSDOT-Main Office to allow for its use as part of the next HPMS submission. There have been no further discussions on adjustments to the Metropolitan Planning Area boundary, which do not need to be finalized until the adoption of the next LRTP in June 2015.

6. New Business

a. Update on *FY 2014-2015 Unified Planning Work Program*

Richard Perrin reported that a postcard announcing the availability of the *FY 2014-2015 UPWP* Call for Projects on the GTC website was issued on Friday, September 13. An applicant workshop was held on Wednesday, September 25 at Henrietta Town Hall with approximately a dozen attendees. Applications are due Friday, October 18 and we anticipate having approximately \$1 million available for requests from GTC staff for professional services, member agencies, and communities in the region.

GTC staff met last week and earlier this week to identify and discuss potential proposals. Two items that GTC staff are seeking concurrence to fund prior to considering proposals received as part of the solicitation are an expansion to the GTC Travel Demand Model to cover the revised Metropolitan Planning Area boundary based on the 2010 Census and the redevelopment of the GTC website to be more user-friendly and able to be updated with current software. Richard reported that he would bring cost estimates to the UPWP Development Committee for its consideration at the initial meeting of that group on November 14 following the next Planning Committee meeting.

b. Presentation on Regional Transit Service Route Analysis and Adjustment (RGRTA)

Crystal Benjamin gave a presentation on the Route Analysis and the Route Overhaul and Refinement Analysis projects. She reported that RGRTA used to use a Trip Score to evaluate Regional Transit Service operations. The last comprehensive Trip Score evaluation was conducted in 2010. RTS has reached the point of diminishing returns on how much can be gained from the Trip Score protocol and has accordingly transitioned to a Route Overhaul process intended to be more customer focused.

Crystal reported that following the Route Overhaul process, RTS has made changes to Routes 10 (Dewey) and 15 (Dewey/Latta) and that the new method has resulted in increases in ridership and customer convenience. Crystal discussed performance metrics and analysis with regards to the reported changes in ridership. She indicated that the Route Overhaul process has been initiated for Route 3A/3B (Lyell) and Route 3 (Goodman).

Crystal also discussed plans for future route reviews, one focus of which will be the Park and Ride routes. David Cook noted that the future bus stop optimization study will also result in efficiencies for bus operations. Crystal Benjamin concluded by reporting that by following these methods it is possible to increase service quality with fewer stops, especially if those stops have better customer amenities.

c. Discussion on TIP Project Delivery Review (GTC Staff)

Richard Perrin reported that GTC staff has been investigating and evaluating a process and the associated parameters for incorporating on-going review of the delivery of projects included in the TIP. This was an activity that GTC staff submitted a proposal for consideration as part of the development of the *FY 2013-2014 UPWP*, which was subsequently withdrawn. GTC staff has conducted a review of prior work done by both state departments of transportation (Florida and Indiana) as well as researchers on behalf of professional associations and academic institutions, and identified key data points and items to include in the analysis (e.g., amounts originally programmed in the TIP, as amended in the TIP, as included in the bid packages, awarded in the contract, and change orders; project type and phase at different cost thresholds; etc.).

Terry Rice noted the need to differentiate between Preventive Maintenance projects and Reconstruction/Rehabilitation projects. There may be value to spending more money on the design of Reconstruction/Rehabilitation projects to be sure the project scope fully captures the work needed. There may also be a need for a higher level of contingency on Reconstruction/Rehabilitation project due to greater uncertainties of the necessary repairs that may not be apparent until after construction has begun.

7. Public Forum

Gerald Lederthiel commented that the Irondequoit Bay Outlet Bridge should be opened to vehicles earlier than November 1 this year due to the recent, unplanned lane closures on the Route 104 bridge over Irondequoit Bay.

8. Next Meeting

November 14, 2013 at NYSDOT – Region 4
1530 Jefferson Road
Henrietta, NY

All materials for items to be considered at this meeting should be submitted to GTC staff no later than Friday, November 1, 2013.

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:55 a.m.